

# Randwick Local Planning Panel (Public) Meeting

Thursday 14 April 2022



**RANDWICK LOCAL PLANNING PANEL (PUBLIC)**

Notice is hereby given that a Randwick Local Planning Panel (Public) meeting will be held online via Microsoft Teams on Thursday, 14 April 2022 at 1pm

**Declarations of Pecuniary and Non-Pecuniary Interests**

**Address of RLPP by Councillors and members of the public**

*Privacy warning;*

*In respect to Privacy & Personal Information Protection Act, members of the public are advised that the proceedings of this meeting will be recorded.*

**General Reports**

GR1/22 Planning Proposal - 11A Marcel Avenue, Coogee ..... 1

Kerry Kyriacou  
**DIRECTOR CITY PLANNING**

## General Report No. GR1/22

**Subject: Planning Proposal - 11A Marcel Avenue, Coogee**

---

### Executive Summary

Randwick City Council is in the process of preparing a Planning Proposal to recognise the heritage values of the property at 11A Marcel Avenue, Coogee.

The proposed Planning Proposal will be consistent with the recommendations outlined within the Heritage Study prepared by City Plan Heritage, dated 25 March 2022 (**see Attachment 1**) relating to heritage significance of the subject site. The Planning Proposal seeks to amend the Randwick Local Environmental Plan 2012 (RLEP 2012) by:



- creating a new local heritage item at 11A Marcel Avenue, Coogee; and
- incorporating 11A Marcel Avenue into the Moira Crescent Heritage Conservation Area (HCA) by extending the boundary of this existing HCA to include this subject site

This report provides an overview of the proposed planning proposal, a summary of events leading to the planning proposal and a summary of key issues, and includes the advice received from City Plan Heritage.

### Recommendation

That the Randwick Local Planning Panel advises Council that it supports the inclusion of a 11A Marcel Avenue, Coogee (Lot 51 DP318884) within Schedule 5 - Part 1 – **Heritage Items** and extension of the boundary of the Moira Crescent Heritage Conservation Area (Schedule 5- Part 2 – **Heritage Conservation Areas**) of Randwick LEP 2012.

### Attachment/s:

1.  Heritage assessment - City Plan Heritage - 11A Marcel Avenue, Coogee
2.  RLPP Resolution on Randwick Heritage Study, 6 April 2021

## Purpose

This report is seeking advice from the Randwick Local Planning Panel (RLPP) on the merits of proposed changes to Schedule 5 and associated heritage maps of the Randwick LEP 2012 based on recommendations from City Plan Heritage in relation to the property at 11A Marcel Avenue, Coogee. The proposed changes implement the relevant planning priorities and actions of the Randwick Local Strategic Planning Statement (LSPS) in relation to heritage conservation in Randwick City.

This report to the RLPP is in accordance with Ministerial Direction (9.1 Local Planning Panels – Planning Proposals) which requires that councils refer planning proposals to local planning panels for advice.

## Discussion

### Background

On 21 December 2021, a Development Application (DA/798/2021) was received for the demolition of a Residential Flat Building consisting of five units, storage and laundry area with a double brick garage on the western side of the allotment at 11A Marcel Avenue, Coogee. The DA was placed on public exhibition between mid-December 2021 and mid-February 2022. A significant number of submissions from the community raised objections to the proposed demolition on the grounds that the existing building, potentially, is heritage significant. Two expert heritage assessments prepared on behalf of local residents were submitted to Council essentially supporting the heritage significance of the property and recommending its heritage protection.

Further, at the Council Meeting on 22 February 2022, Council resolved as follows:

***“RESOLUTION: (Neilson/Hamilton) that Council officers urgently undertake a preliminary heritage assessment of the building at 11A Marcel Ave, Coogee to determine if it is, or is likely to be found, on further inquiry and investigation, to be of local heritage significance.”***

In February 2022, in view of the concerns raised in the submissions, and having regard to Council’s resolution, the DA was referred to heritage consultants, City Plan Heritage, for an assessment of the heritage significance of the property.

On 25 February 2022, City Plan Heritage provided Council with a Heritage Assessment of No 11A Marcel Avenue (which the Assessment refers to by its historical name, “Denison Hall”) finding, among other things, that:

*“11a Marcel Avenue meets three of the seven Significance Assessment criteria at the Local level and is one of the Inter-War flat buildings that presents the characteristics of the Californian bungalow idiom applied to residential flat buildings.”*

Accordingly, City Plan Heritage recommended in the Assessment that:

1. *11a Marcel Avenue is nominated for inclusion as a heritage item under Part 1 (Heritage items) of Schedule 5 attached to Randwick Local Environmental Plan 2012.*
2. *The boundary of the Moira Crescent Conservation Area is amended to include all the allotments offered for sale as part of the fourth subdivision of the Bishops court Estate as shown in Deposited Plan 13810 held by NSW Land Registry Services.*

It should be noted that City Plan Heritage have also been separately commissioned by Council to undertake the preparation of State Heritage Inventory (SHI) Forms and Statement of Significance for 57 community nominated properties and extension to the Moira Crescent Heritage Conservation Area as recommended by Extent Heritage consultants in 2020. The findings and recommendation of the Extent heritage study, including the extension of the Moira Crescent HCA, was considered by the Randwick Local Planning Panel at its meeting on 6 April 2021.

The heritage study recommendations, including the boundary extension to the Moira Crescent HCA (see Figure 1 below) were reported to the RLPP meeting on 6 April 2021 as required under Ministerial Direction (9.1 Local Planning Panels – Planning Proposals) which requires that councils refer planning proposals to local planning panels for advice. The RLPP considered and supported the recommendations of the report (**see Attachment 2**). The SHI forms and Significance Statements have been completed and are currently being processed for public exhibition as part of the heritage proposal of the Randwick Comprehensive Planning Proposal and Randwick LEP review.



Figure 1: Boundary extension proposed by Extent Heritage to the Moira Crescent HCA including 4 recommended heritage items (**red outline** shows the proposed extension) 11A Marcel Avenue is shown outside the proposed HCA boundary extension (in **blue outline**). Source: Extent Heritage 2021

## Issues

In view of City Plan Heritage's recommendation, Council, under delegated authority, placed an Interim Heritage Order (IHO) on the building and site at 11A Marcel Avenue Coogee (Lot 51 DP318884) on 4 March 2022. The IHO became effective from Friday, 4 March 2022 following notification of the IHO in the Government Gazette (Government Gazette No. – Planning and Heritage). The IHO is consistent with the provisions of the Heritage Act 1977 and the Heritage Guidelines. In particular, Section 25 of the Heritage Act 1977 authorises a council to make an Interim Heritage Order for a building or place that council considers may be found to be of local heritage significance and is being or is likely to be harmed. The property warrants preservation in line with the assessment, findings and recommendations of the heritage assessment prepared by Council's heritage consultant, City Plan Heritage, dated 25 February 2022, and in view of its proposed demolition under development application No: DA/798/2021.

Notice of the interim heritage order is now online and can be viewed at the following link:

[Government Gazette No 88 – 4 March 2022.pdf](#)

The Ministerial Order authorising the making of Interim Heritage Orders requires that a council must not make an Interim Heritage Order (IHO) unless:

- (a) an environmental planning instrument containing a schedule of heritage items derived from a heritage study and provisions for the management of those items is in force in the Local Government Area.

**Comment:** The Randwick LEP 2012 meets this criterion.

- (b) it has considered a preliminary heritage assessment of the item prepared by a person with appropriate heritage knowledge, skills and experience employed or retained by the council and considers that the item is or is likely to be found on further inquiry and investigation, to be of local heritage significance.

**Comment:** City Plan Heritage has suitable heritage knowledge, skills and experience and their assessment report identifies that No 11A Marcel Avenue meets criteria A (historic), and C (aesthetic), G (representative) when assessing significance in accordance with “Assessing Heritage Significance”, prepared by the NSW Heritage Office.

In regard to criterion A, City Plan Heritage advises that:

*“Denison Hall has historical significance as part of the fourth subdivision of the Bishopscourt Estate in 1926 and as evidence of the suburbanisation of Randwick in the first half of the twentieth century. The scale, materiality, and setbacks of Denison Hall reflect the building covenant attached to land sold as part of the fourth subdivision of the Bishopscourt Estate and contribute to the identified heritage significance of the Moira Crescent Conservation Area. Denison Hall is representative of the Inter-war residential development and the 1920s boom in flat construction throughout metropolitan Sydney.”*

In regard to Criterion C, City Plan Heritage advises that:

*“Despite minor changes, Denison Hall demonstrates the characteristics of the Californian Bungalow idiom applied to an Inter-war flat building including projecting window frames, geometric patterned lead light glazing, grouped posts, and street-facing gable. Its scale and materiality are compatible with the one and two storey residential buildings within the Moira Crescent Heritage Conservation Area.*

*Denison Hall demonstrates the characteristic of Inter-war flat buildings within Randwick LGA and meets the threshold for listing as a heritage item at the Local level under Criterion (c).”*

In regard to Criterion G, City Plan Heritage advises that:

*“Despite minor modifications, Denison Hall demonstrates the characteristics of Inter-war flat buildings constructed throughout Randwick LGA.*

- *Is a fine example of its type*
- *Has the principal characteristics of an important class or group of items*
- *Has attributes typical of a particular way of life, philosophy, custom, significant process, design, technique or activity”*

- (c) the item is being or is likely to be harmed.

**Comment:** If there is a development application for demolition of the potential heritage item, then that is sufficient evidence that it is likely to be harmed.

- (d) the IHO is confined to the item determined as being under threat.

**Comment:** The proposed IHO will be confined to No 11A Marcel Avenue, Coogee as being the property under threat.

Accordingly, there were adequate grounds for the making of the interim heritage order to protect the property at No 11A Marcel Avenue from likely harm. The interim heritage order will be in place for a period of 6 months (being 4 September 2022) subject to further extension if required. During this period, Council has the opportunity to protect the subject property by preparing a planning proposal.

Council has now been notified that a Class 1 appeal against the Interim Heritage Order has been lodged.

### **Planning Process**

A planning proposal is the first step to commence changes to the planning provisions relating to land. It is a formal application that sets out the objectives, intended outcomes, and justification for the proposed changes, and also details the community consultation to be undertaken.

The NSW Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 (EP&A Act) and Regulations set out the process for amending the planning provisions (heritage) relating to land in NSW. Changes to the planning provisions can only be made via a formal amendment to the Randwick LEP.

### **Gateway Determination**

If Council resolves to proceed with the subject Planning Proposal, it will be forwarded to the Minister for Planning for a 'Gateway Determination'. The 'Gateway Determination' is essentially a checkpoint for planning proposals, and enables those proposals that are not well founded, or not in the public interest to be stopped early in the process, before significant resources are committed in carrying out technical studies or investigations.

The Minister's 'Gateway Determination' will stipulate whether the subject Planning Proposal should proceed, whether it needs to be resubmitted, the timeframe for its completion (usually nine months from the date of the Determination), the community consultation requirements and State/Commonwealth agency requirements and whether a public hearing is needed.

### **Exhibition and Making of Amendments**

Following the 'Gateway Determination', the Planning Proposal will be formally placed on public exhibition for comment. The final LEP and accompanying maps which amend the Council's principal planning instrument (i.e. the RLEP 2012) are made by the Minister for Planning (and notified on the NSW legislation web site) in accordance with the EP&A Act. Certain LEPs which are of local significance can be finalised by Council via delegation from the Minister (this is determined at the Gateway stage).

### **Site description and context**

The property that is the subject of the heritage study is located on the southern side of Marcel Avenue, Randwick (Figure 1). The street address is given as 11A Marcel Avenue, Randwick and is described as Lot 51 in Deposited Plan 318884.

The site is bounded on the northeast by Marcel Avenue, on the southeast by a single storey residence (15 Marcel Avenue), to the southwest by single storey residence (28 Ritchard Avenue) and to the northwest by a three-storey apartment building (11 Marcel Avenue).



Image 1: Aerial photograph of the subject property (11A Marcel Avenue, Coogee) outlined in 'red'.



Image 2: General view of the main façade, looking westwards

The surrounding context is characterised by a variety of lot and building sizes, featuring a mix of Federation and Inter-War buildings comprising single and multi-dwelling residences, and some contemporary infill development fronting Marcel Avenue and further east along Moira Crescent.

**Local Planning Framework**

***Randwick Local Environmental Plan 2012***

The property is proposed as an item of local heritage significance and for inclusion within an extension to the Moira Crescent Heritage Conservation Area is 11A Marcel Avenue, Coogee. The



property is currently zoned R3 Medium Density Residential under RLEP 2012 with a maximum height limit of 12 metres and FSR of 0.9:1.

The existing zoning and development standards currently applying to the sites are not proposed to change as a result of the Planning Proposal.

### The Planning Proposal

The Planning Proposal will be prepared for submission to the DPE seeking the Gateway Determination. The purpose of the Planning Proposal is to amend the RLEP 2012 Schedule 5 Part 1 – Heritage Items and associated maps to include 11A Marcel Avenue, Coogee as a heritage item.

The planning proposal also will seek to incorporate the 11A Marcel Avenue, Coogee as part of the extension to the Moira Crescent Heritage Conservation Area.

Inclusion of this item in the schedule is pursuant to Clause 5.10 – Heritage Conservation of the Randwick LEP which sets out the objectives and requirements to be considered as part of development assessment.

### Strategic alignment

The relationship with the City Plan is as follows:

Outcome/Direction	Delivery Program actions
Outcome	7. Heritage that is protected and celebrated.
Direction	7a. Our heritage is recognised, protected and celebrated.

### Resourcing Strategy implications

Costs are associated with legal fees to oppose the appeal against the interim heritage order for 11A Marcel Avenue, Coogee. The costs associated with preparation of the Planning Proposal including heritage assessment is accommodated within Council's operational budget.

### Policy and legislative requirements

Heritage Conservation section 5.10 of the *Randwick Local Environment Plan 2012*, State and National registers have been considered by the consultant in the development of the Study.

The relevant planning priorities and actions of the Randwick Local Strategic Planning Statement (LSPS) and the Housing strategy in relation to this work are contained in the Tables 1 and 2 below:

**Table 1:** Relationship to the LSPS

LSPS action	LEP update
<b>4.1 Undertake a Heritage Study of Randwick City to identify additional heritage items and HCAs including boundary adjustments where necessary.</b>	Consistent <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A stand alone Planning Proposal is being prepared to list 11A Marcel Avenue and extend the boundary of the Moira Crescent Heritage Conservation Area under Schedule 5 of the Randwick LEP</li> </ul>

LSPS action	LEP update
	consistent with heritage advice received by Council.

**Table 2:** Relationship to the Housing Strategy

Housing Strategy action	LEP update
<p><b>5.4 Undertake a Heritage review of Randwick City to identify additional heritage items and HCAs including boundary adjustments where necessary.</b></p>	<p>Consistent</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A stand alone Planning Proposal to list 11A Marcel Avenue and extend the boundary of the Moira Crescent Heritage Conservation Area under Schedule 5 of the Randwick LEP consistent with heritage advice received by Council.</li> </ul>

**S.9.1 Policy and legislative requirements**

The Planning Proposal is consistent with the following Ministerial Directions:

- Implementation of Regional Plans (Direction 1.1)
- Heritage Conservation (Direction 3.2)
- Residential zone (Direction 6.1)

Direction	Comment
<p><b>1. Focus area 1: Planning Systems</b></p> <p><b>1.1. Implementation of Regional Plans</b></p>	<p>Consistent.</p> <p>The Planning Proposal is in accordance with the following state plans issued by the Greater Sydney Commission:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) Greater Sydney Region Plan - A Metropolis of Three Cities</li> <li>b) Eastern City District Plan</li> </ul> <p>The Planning Proposal is consistent with the aims and objectives of these publications because it is consistent with Priority E6 Objective 13 <i>Environmental heritage is identified, conserved and enhanced.</i></p> <p>The Planning Proposal is consistent with the aims and objectives of these</p>

Direction	Comment
	<p>publications for the following reasons:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) It implements the findings of the independent heritage assessment which indicates that the property meets three (3) of the criteria for heritage significance</li> <li>b) The proposed heritage listing of the property will ensure the site will continue to contribute to the heritage streetscape and Moira Crescent HCA.</li> <li>c) It supports conservation of an existing Interwar Residential Flat Building consistent with the values of residents within the community.</li> </ul>
<b>1.2. Development of Aboriginal Land Council land</b>	N/A
<b>1.3. Approval and referral requirements</b>	N/A
<b>1.4. Site specific provisions</b>	N/A
<b>Focus area 1: Planning Systems – Place based</b>	
<b>1.5. Parramatta Road Corridor Urban Transformation Strategy</b>	N/A
<b>1.6. Implementation of North West Priority Growth Area Land Use and Infrastructure Implementation Plan</b>	N/A
<b>1.7. Implementation of Greater Parramatta Priority Growth Area Interim Land Use and Infrastructure Implementation Plan</b>	N/A
<b>1.8. Implementation of Wilton Priority Growth Area Interim Land Use and Infrastructure Implementation Plan</b>	N/A
<b>1.9. Implementation of Glenfield to Macarthur Urban Renewal Corridor</b>	N/A
<b>1.10. Implementation of Western Sydney Aerotropolis Plan</b>	N/A
<b>1.11. Implementation of Bayside West Precincts 2036 Plan</b>	N/A
<b>1.12. Implementation of Planning Principles for the Cooks Cove Precinct</b>	N/A
<b>1.13. Implementation of St Leonards and Cros Nest 2036 Plan</b>	N/A

Direction	Comment
1.14. Implementation of Greater Macarthur 2040	N/A
1.15. Implementation of Pymont Peninsula Place Strategy	N/A
1.16. North West Rail Link Corridor Strategy	N/A
1.17. Implementation of the Bays West Place Strategy	N/A
2. Focus Area 2: Design and Place	N/A
3. Focus Area 3: Biodiversity and Conservation	
3.1. Conservation Zones	N/A
3.2. Heritage Conservation	<p>Consistent.</p> <p>The Planning Proposal will explain and justify the conservation of the building and integrity of the Moira Crescent HCA.</p>
3.3. Sydney Drinking Water Catchments	N/A
3.4. Recreation Vehicle Areas	N/A
4. Focus area 4: Resilience and Hazards	
4.1. Flooding	N/A
4.2. Coastal Management	N/A
4.3. Planning for Bushfire Protection	N/A
4.4. Remediation of Contaminated Land	N/A
4.5. Acid Sulfate Soils	N/A
4.6. Mine Subsidence and Unstable Land	N/A
5. Focus Area 5: Transport and Infrastructure	
5.1. Integrating Land Use and Transport	N/A
5.2. Reserving Land for Public Purposes	N/A
5.3. Development Near Regulated Airports and Defence Airfields	N/A
5.4. Shooting Ranges	N/A
6. Focus area 6: Housing	
6.1. Residential Zones	<p>Consistent.</p> <p>This Direction is applicable as the Planning Proposal affects land in residential zones. The Planning Proposal is consistent as it maintains the residential use of the property whilst protecting its conservation as</p>

Direction	Comment
	a heritage item and its contribution to the Moira Crescent HCA.
<b>6.2. Caravan Parks and Manufactured Home Estates</b>	N/A
<b>7. Focus Area 7: Industry and Employment</b>	
<b>7.1. Business and Industrial Uses</b>	N/A
<b>7.2. Reduction in non-hosted short-term rental accommodation period</b>	N/A
<b>7.3. Commercial and Retail Development along the Pacific Highway, North Coast</b>	N/A
<b>8. Focus area 8: Resources and Energy</b>	
<b>8.1. Mining, Petroleum Production and Extractive Industries</b>	N/A
<b>9. Focus area 9: Primary Production</b>	
<b>9.1. Rural Zones</b>	N/A
<b>9.2. Rural Lands</b>	N/A
<b>9.3. Oyster Aquaculture</b>	N/A
<b>9.4. Farmland of State and Regional Significance on the NSW Far North Coast</b>	N/A

## Conclusion

The Planning Proposal seeks to amend Schedule 5 of the RLEP 2012 to recognise 11A Marcel Avenue, Coogee as a local heritage items, and incorporate the subject property within the Moira Crescent Heritage Conservation Area via an extension to this HCA boundary. The preparation of the Planning Proposal should be supported on the following basis:

- The subject property has been demonstrated to meet the NSW Heritage Council assessment criteria for local heritage listing based on its historical, aesthetic and representative significance. These properties collectively represent the Interwar Period and/or retain features of the Interwar character which contribute to the heritage significance of the proposed extended heritage conservation area.
- The planning proposal is consistent with several key strategic directions on heritage conservation articulated in the state and local strategic planning framework including:
  - Eastern City District Plan Planning Priority E6 – Creating and renewing great places and local centres, and respecting the District’s heritage
  - Randwick Local Environment Plan 2012 Clause 5.10 – Heritage Conservation objectives and controls which aim to conserve the environmental heritage of Randwick
  - Randwick City Plan Strategic directions/outcomes which focus on protecting and celebrating local heritage (Outcome 7, Direction 7a)
  - Ministerial Directions which require that Planning Proposals contain provisions to facilitate the conservation of heritage

- The proposed new heritage item and extended heritage conservation area will have positive social effects for the local community through the retention and conservation of buildings with historical value and which represent the historical development of the area.

The assessment of the heritage significance of 11A Marcel Avenue prepared by City Plan Heritage demonstrates that the properties meet the NSW Heritage Council's criteria for historic, aesthetic and representative significance and is worthy as an item of local heritage significance.

In view of the above, it is recommended that:

- the proposed Planning Proposal be supported;
- the proposed items be placed on the heritage schedule (Schedule 5, Part 1) of the Randwick LEP; and
- The Moira Crescent Heritage Conservation Area boundary be extended to include the subject property at 11A Marcel Avenue and placed on the heritage schedule (Schedule 5, Part 2) of the Randwick LEP.

---

**Responsible officer:** David Ongkili, Coordinator Strategic Planning

**File Reference:** F2016/00475



GR1/22

A large graphic element consisting of a dark blue diagonal shape on the left containing the title text, and a grey area on the right featuring a background of 3D wireframe cubes and a blurred city skyline.

# Heritage Assessment

## Denison Hall

11A Marcel Avenue, Randwick NSW 2031

Prepared for Randwick Council


MARCH 2022



Heritage Assessment  
Denison Hall  
11A Marcel Avenue, Randwick NSW 2031  
Project # H-22011  
March 2022

GR1/22

## REPORT REVISION HISTORY

Revision	Date Issued	Revision Description			
01	23/02/2022	DRAFT	<b>Prepared by</b>	<b>Reviewed by</b>	
			Pam Jeffery <i>Senior Heritage Consultant</i>	Kerime Danis <i>Director - Heritage</i>	
			Kerime Danis <i>Director - Heritage</i>		Kerime Danis <i>Director - Heritage</i>
02	25/02/2022 16/03/2022	FINAL	<b>Prepared by</b>	<b>Reviewed by</b>	
			Kerime Danis <i>Director - Heritage</i>	Kerime Danis <i>Director - Heritage</i>	Kerime Danis <i>Director - Heritage</i>

### Disclaimer

This report has been prepared by City Plan Heritage P/L with input from a number of other expert consultants (if relevant). To the best of our knowledge, the information contained herein is neither false nor misleading and the contents are based on information and facts that were correct at the time of writing. City Plan Heritage P/L accepts no responsibility or liability for any errors, omissions or resultant consequences including any loss or damage arising from reliance in information in this publication.

Copyright © City Plan Heritage P/L  
ABN 46 103 185 413

All Rights Reserved. No material may be reproduced without prior permission.

**City Plan Heritage P/L**  
Level 6, 120 Sussex St, Sydney NSW 2000  
P +61 2 8270 3500  
[CITYPLAN.COM.AU](http://CITYPLAN.COM.AU)

M:\CP\Heritage\Cph-2022\22-011 11A Marcel Ave Coogee\3. Report\Heritage Assessment\_11A Marcel Ave, Coogee-FINAL.docx

Page | i





Heritage Assessment  
Denison Hall  
11A Marcel Avenue, Randwick NSW 2031  
Project # H-22011  
March 2022

GR1/22

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>1. Introduction</b>	<b>5</b>
1.1. Background	5
1.2. Methodology	5
1.3. Author Identification	5
1.4. Location	5
1.5. Limitations	6
<b>2. Historical context</b>	<b>7</b>
2.1. Pre- European Occupation	7
2.2. Bishopscourt	7
2.3. Subdivision and Suburbanisation	11
2.4. Denison Hall	12
2.5. Summary Chain of Ownership	13
<b>3. Site Description</b>	<b>16</b>
3.1. Site Context	16
3.2. Site Description	16
3.3. Description of Denison Hall	16
3.3.1. Generally	16
3.3.2. Description of the Building Exterior	16
3.3.3. Description of the Interiors	18
<b>4. Comparable buildings in the local area</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>5. Assessment of Cultural Significance</b>	<b>23</b>
5.1. Basis of Assessment	23
5.2. Assessment Criteria	23
5.3. Statement of Significance	27
<b>6. Conclusions and recommendations</b>	<b>27</b>
<b>7. Bibliography</b>	<b>29</b>
<b>8. Appendices</b>	<b>30</b>
8.1. Covenant attached to Certificate of Title Volume 4069 Folio 26	30

## FIGURES

Figure 1: Cadastral map showing the location 11A Marcel Avenue	6
Figure 2: Bishop's Court, Randwick photographed by Joseph Bishoff in the 1870s	7

**City Plan Heritage P/L**  
Level 6, 120 Sussex St, Sydney NSW 2000  
P +61 2 8270 3500  
[CITYPLAN.COM.AU](http://CITYPLAN.COM.AU)

M:\CPHeritage\Cph-2022\22-011 11A Marcel Ave Coogee\3. Report\Heritage Assessment\_11A Marcel Ave, Coogee-FINAL.docx

Page | ii



Heritage Assessment  
Denison Hall  
11A Marcel Avenue, Randwick NSW 2031  
Project # H-22011  
March 2022

GR1/22

Figure 3: Plan of Bishopscourt grounds showing the location of the residence, stables, and carriage loop.....	8
Figure 4. Advertisement for the sale of the Bishopscourt Estate. ....	9
Figure 5: Ruins of the Good Samaritan Convent. ....	10
Figure 6: Diagram showing the first subdivision of Bisopscourt Estate, 1899. ....	11
Figure 7: Sales notice for the second subdivision of Bishopscourt Estate, 1919.....	11
Figure 8: Sales notice for the third subdivision of Bishopscourt Estate, 1925. ....	12
Figure 9: Sales notice for the fourth subdivision of Bishopscourt Estate, 1927. ....	12
Figure 10. Detail from Deposited Plan 13810 showing the land (lot 52 and part lot 51) purchased by AH Padey on 23 October 1928. Lot 53 (shaded blue was acquired by AH Padey in February 1937.....	13
Figure 11. General view of the facade of the existing building. ....	17
Figure 12. Detail of the inside face of a typical curved balustrade.....	17
Figure 13. View of the concrete retaining wall located on the boundary with Marcel Avenue.....	17
Figure 14. General view of the main façade, looking westwards. ....	17
Figure 15. Partial view of the rockface and sandstone blocks forming the retaining wall running east-west through the middle of the subject site. ....	17
Figure 16. General view of the steps linking the basement level to the rear yard of 11a Marcel Avenue. ....	17
Figure 17. View of the existing driveway and garages located to the northwest of the flat building. ...	18
Figure 18.Rear elevation of the building.....	18
Figure 19. Floor plan of Unit 4.....	18
Figure 20. Interior of Unit 3 photographed c2022 showing the original polished joinery including plate rail, door and window joinery, and brick fireplace. ....	19
Figure 21. Interior of Unit 1 showing an original 1929 screen. Note the polished joinery has been painted, photographed July 2020. ....	19
Figure 22. unit-1-11a-marcel-ave-coogee-nsw-2034.....	19
Figure 23. Bedroom 1 looking towards Marcel Avenue photographed 2020. ....	20
Figure 24. Bedroom 2 looking towards Marcel Avenue. ....	20
Figure 25. View of the refurbished kitchen in Unit 1, photographed 2016. ....	20
Figure 26. View of the enclosed rear verandah of Unit 1 showing recent metal framed windows photographed 2016. 20	
Figure 27. Enclosed rear verandah photographed 2020.....	20
Figure 28: 31 Marcel Avenue, Coogee item no. I405.....	21
Figure 29: 2 Prince Street, Randwick, item no. I432.....	21
Figure 30: 101 Brook Street, Coogee item no. I64.....	22
Figure 31: 5 Kurrawa Avenue, Coogee, Potential Heritage Item.....	22

**City Plan Heritage P/L**  
Level 6, 120 Sussex St, Sydney NSW 2000  
P +61 2 8270 3500  
[CITYPLAN.COM.AU](http://CITYPLAN.COM.AU)

M:\CPHeritage\Cph-2022\22-011 11A Marcel Ave Coogee\3. Report\Heritage Assessment\_11A Marcel Ave, Coogee-FINAL.docx

Page | iii



Heritage Assessment  
Denison Hall  
11A Marcel Avenue, Randwick NSW 2031  
Project # H-22011  
March 2022

Figure 32: 24 Marcel Avenue, Coogee Potential Heritage Item ..... 22  
Figure 33: 26 Marcel Avenue, Coogee Potential Heritage Item ..... 22  
Figure 34: Recommended extension to Moira Crescent Heritage Conservation Area boundaries ..... 28

GR1/22

**City Plan Heritage P/L**  
Level 6, 120 Sussex St, Sydney NSW 2000  
P +61 2 8270 3500  
[CITYPLAN.COM.AU](http://CITYPLAN.COM.AU)

M:\CPHeritage\Cph-2022\22-011 11A Marcel Ave Coogee\3. Report\Heritage Assessment\_11A Marcel Ave, Coogee-FINAL.docx

Page | iv



Heritage Assessment  
Denison Hall  
11A Marcel Avenue, Randwick NSW 2031  
Project # H-22011  
March 2022

GR1/22

## 1. INTRODUCTION

### 1.1. Background

City Plan Heritage (CPH) was engaged by Randwick Council to undertake a heritage assessment of 11A Marcel Avenue Randwick NSW 2031 (subject site). The property is not currently located within a conservation area or identified as a heritage item attached to any statutory instrument.

It is noted that a Development Application (DA/798/2022) has been lodged with the Council seeking demolition of the existing flat building dating from the Inter-War period. Therefore, the Randwick City Council required preparation of an independent heritage assessment of the subject property in order to assist in making decision whether the subject property has any heritage value and provide advice on the management of likely heritage values associated with the subject site.

We have reviewed the two heritage reports prepared by Ruth Daniell and Prof. Richard Mackay submitted by the neighbour in objection to the proposed demolition of the subject building at 11A Marcel Avenue. While we have reviewed the submitted two heritage reports, we have undertaken our independent heritage assessment as requested by the Council. Our assessment is based historical and physical analysis and on our knowledge of the heritage items and potential heritage items in the local area and extended Randwick LGA.

It should be noted that CPH has been providing the Randwick City Council heritage referrals for their overflow Development Applications since 2003 and has undertaken a number of heritage studies for existing heritage conservation areas. Our most recent study, which is being at the finalisation stage, is the peer review of the 57 Potential Heritage Items including the Moira Crescent HCA undertaken by Extent. Therefore, we have extensive knowledge of the existing built heritage within the Randwick LGA that has enabled us to make an informed assessment of the subject property at 11a Marcel Avenue in Coogee.

### 1.2. Methodology

This Heritage Assessment has been prepared in accordance with the NSW Heritage Manual 'Assessing Heritage Significance' guidelines. The philosophy and process adopted is that guided by *The Burra Charter: Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance, 2013* (Burra Charter 2013).

### 1.3. Author Identification

The following report has been prepared by Pamela Jeffery (Senior Heritage Consultant) in association with Kerime Danis (Director - Heritage) who has provided input, and reviewed and endorsed its content.

Images used throughout this report were prepared by CPH unless otherwise noted.

### 1.4. Location

The subject site is located on the southern side of Marcel Avenue, Randwick (Figure 1). The street address is given as 11A Marcel Avenue, Randwick and is described as Lot 51 in Deposited Plan 318884 (Parish of Alexandria, County of Cumberland) held by NSW Land Registry Services.

The site is bounded on the northeast by Marcel Avenue, on the southeast by a single storey residence (15 Marcel Avenue), to the southwest by single storey residence (28 Ritchard Avenue) and to the northwest by a three-storey apartment building (11 Marcel Avenue).



























































