



MINUTES OF RANDWICK LOCAL PLANNING PANEL (ELECTRONIC) MEETING HELD ON THURSDAY, 14 APRIL 2022

Present:

Chairperson:

Annelise Tuor

Expert Members:

Kara Krason & Deborah Laidlaw

Community Representatives:

Peter Ryan

Council Officers present:

Coordinator Fast Track
Coordinator Major Assessment

Mr T Ristevski
Mr S Cox

Declarations of Pecuniary and Non-Pecuniary Interests

NIL.

The Panel deliberated and voted on each matter via an electronic meeting.

The resolutions, reasons and voting outcomes for each item on the agenda are detailed below:

Development Application Reports

**D12/22 Development Application Report - 64 Portland Crescent, Maroubra
(DA/156/2021)**

RESOLUTION:

1. That the RLPP is satisfied that the matters detailed in clause 4.6(4) of Randwick Local Environmental Plan 2012 have been adequately addressed and that consent may be granted to the development application, which contravenes the height of buildings development standard in Clause 4.3 of Randwick Local Environmental Plan 2012. The concurrence of the Secretary of Planning and Environment may be assumed.
2. That the RLPP grant deferred commencement consent under Sections 4.16 and 4.17 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979, as amended, to Development Application No. DA/156/2021 for demolition of existing structures and construction of a 3 storey residential flat building comprising six (6) units, basement parking, tree removal, landscaping and associated works (affordable rental housing proposed), at No. 64 Portland Crescent, Maroubra, subject to the following deferred commencement conditions and conditions attached to the assessment report, as amended:

Deferred Commencement Conditions

Pursuant to Section 4.16 (3) of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979, notice is given that the abovementioned development application has been determined by granting of **deferred commencement** consent subject to the following conditions below:-

The consent is not to operate until evidence of the following has been submitted to and approved by the Council's Manager of Development Assessment.

3. Amend the basement plan by reducing the size of the basement to the minimum area required to accommodate six (6) car parking spaces and other storage and reasonable services and circulation (including reduction of ceiling heights of the basement) to facilitate additional deep soil areas for the development and demonstrate that the planting shown in the landscape plan (LPDA21-194 Sheet LP-02, dated November 2021, revision E) over the basement can be successfully implemented.
4. The amended basement plan is to provide one car parking space for each unit with the exception of Studio Unit 1 and an additional visitor car parking space (Six (6) car parking spaces in total).
5. Amend the architectural plans to include:
 - I. Bedroom 1 in Unit 6 on the Second Floor level shall be deleted. The area of the bedroom is to form part of the open-plan Living/Dining area and the Unit 6 shall be amended to a maximum of two (2) bedrooms.
 - II. The balustrade to the front south eastern elevation balcony of the Second Floor is to be reduced in length by 750mm at each end to ensure the balustrade does not extend above the roof pitch.
 - III. The balustrade to the rear north western elevation balcony of the Second Floor is to be reduced in length by 750mm at each end to ensure the balustrade does not extend above the roof pitch.
 - IV. Privacy screens having a height of 1.6m (measured above the finished floor level) shall be provided to the following:
 - Rear north-western First Floor level balcony, along the entire north-eastern side and south-western side of the balcony;Privacy screens must be constructed with either:
 - Translucent or obscured glazing (The use of film applied to the clear glass pane is unacceptable);
 - Fixed lattice/slats with individual openings not more than 30mm wide;
 - Fixed vertical or horizontal louvres with the individual blades angled and spaced appropriately to prevent overlooking into the private open space or windows of the adjacent dwellings.
 - V. The following windows must have a minimum sill height of 1.6m above floor level, or alternatively, the window/s are to be fixed and be provided with translucent, obscured, frosted or sandblasted glazing below this specified height, or be fitted with fixed vertical or horizontal louvres with the individual blades angled and spaced appropriately to prevent overlooking into the private open space or windows of the adjacent dwellings:
First Floor Level
 - North-east elevation - WF.01 to Bed 1, WF.02 to Bath, WF.05 to Bath, and WF.06 to Kitchen;
 - South-west elevation - WF.08 to Walk-in Robe, WF.09 to En-suite, and WF.10 to Bed 1;Second Floor Level
 - North-east elevation - WS.01 to Bed 3, and WF.03 to Living area;
 - South-west elevation – WS.04 to Living area, WS.05 to Bath, and WS.06 to Bed 2.
6. An amended landscape plan, prepared by a qualified professional in the Landscape industry (must be eligible for membership with AILD, AILA or equivalent), which is consistent with the amended architectural plans that addresses:

- a. A Planting Plan & Plant Schedule which includes proposed species, botanic and common names, pot size at the time of planting, quantity, location, dimensions at maturity and any other details required to describe the works;
- b. A predominance of species that can withstand poor quality sandy soils and are not reliant on high quantities of moisture and fertilizer for survival;
- c. A high-quality selection and arrangement of decorative species throughout the front setback so as to assist with presentation of this development to the streetscape;
- d. Any new walls or planting within the garden bed shown across the front property boundary, within a distance of 2 metres of either side of the new driveway, must not exceed 600mm in height, so as to maintain a clear line of sight of approaching pedestrians and vehicles, and must also be those which will not encroach out onto the public footpath and obscure access;
- e. Deep soil garden beds with a minimum width of 2 metres are to be provided across the width of the rear boundary, to which, a generous arrangement and layering of species shall be provided, with the extent of the deck as currently shown to be reduced so as to comply with this requirement;
- f. Dedicated garden areas around the perimeter of the site, to which, evergreen screen planting and decorative lower growing species shall be provided so as to ensure reasonable level of future privacy and amenity, for both occupants and neighbours;
- g. A minimum of 4 x 100 litre (pot size at the time of planting) trees within the site, selecting NATIVE species which will attain a minimum height of between 4-7 metres at maturity, and are to be strategically located within areas of deep soil where possible, as well as to maximise future screening and privacy between this site and adjoining properties;
- h. Additional notation showing soil and mulch details, irrigation, edging, paving, fencing, lighting details, surface finishes, retaining walls, decking and any other landscape elements in order to fully describe the proposed landscape works.
- i. All planter boxes and garden beds constructed on slab must have a minimum soil depth of 600mm and all lawn areas must have a minimum soil depth of 300mm, with construction details to be provided to confirm compliance
- j. Written certification from a qualified professional in the Landscape industry (must be eligible for membership with a nationally recognised organisation/association) must state that the Landscape Plan/s comply with the requirements specified above.

Evidence required to satisfy the above conditions must be submitted to Council within 12 months of the date of this consent.

Subject to compliance with the deferred commencement condition, to the satisfaction of the Manager of Development Assessment, development consent may then be granted subject to the following general conditions:

General Conditions

7. Amend condition 1 to include (LPDA21-194 Sheet LP-02, dated November 2021, revision E).
8. Amend Condition 8 as follows: Insert at the end of the first paragraph: "Specifically, the external wall material of the second floor should be cladding in a darker matt colour that is more compatible with the darker tones of the roof material and dormer windows".
9. Delete Conditions 2, 36 and Condition 37.

REASON:

The Panel has visited or is familiar with the site, considered the submissions and reviewed the assessment report prepared by Council officers that addresses the relevant matters detailed in Section 4.15 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979, as amended.

The Panel supports the application for the reasons given in the assessment report, subject to amendments to conditions to include deferred commencement conditions that require deep soil through amendments to the basement to ensure adequate landscaping for the site as well as other amendments relevant to privacy and materials.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

D13/22 Development Application Report - 52-56 Carr Street, Coogee (DA/668/2021)

RESOLUTION:

- A. That the RLPP is satisfied that the matters detailed in clause 4.6(4) of Randwick Local Environmental Plan 2012 have been adequately addressed and that consent may be granted to the development application, which contravenes the height of building development standard in Clause 4.3 of Randwick Local Environmental Plan 2012. The concurrence of the Secretary of Planning and Environment may be assumed.
- B. That the RLPP grant consent under Sections 4.16 and 4.17 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979, as amended, to Development Application No. DA/688/2021 for alterations and additions to an existing building, extension of existing lift service to top two levels and associated works, at No. 52-56 Carr Street, Coogee, subject to the development consent conditions attached to the assessment report as amended to include new condition as follows:

Condition 22

Access to the roof top shall be for maintenance purposes only. This approval does not give consent to use of the roof top area for recreational purposes such as private or communal open space.

REASON:

The Panel has visited or is familiar with the site and reviewed the assessment report prepared by Council officers that addresses the relevant matters detailed in Section 4.15 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979, as amended.

The Panel supports the application for the reasons given in the assessment report. The Panel has added a condition to clarify that the lifts, as extended to the roof level, can only be used for access for maintenance purposes and not to provide access to the roof for any other purposes.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

D14/22 Development Application Report - 669-677 Anzac Parade, Maroubra (DA/1/2022)

RESOLUTION:

That the RLPP grant consent under Sections 4.16 and 4.17 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979, as amended, to Development Application No. DA/1/2022 for new shopfront signage, at Unit 3, No. 669-677 Anzac Parade, Maroubra, subject to the development consent conditions attached to the assessment report.

REASON:

The Panel has visited or is familiar with the site, reviewed the assessment report prepared by Council officers that addresses the relevant matters detailed in Section 4.15 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979, as amended.

The Panel supports the application for the reasons given in the assessment report.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

D15/22 Development Application Report - 70 Coogee Bay Road, Coogee (DA/451/2021)

RESOLUTION:

- A. That the RLPP is not satisfied that the matters detailed in clause 4.6(4) of Randwick Local Environmental Plan 2012 have been adequately addressed and consequently consent may not be granted to the development application, which contravenes the height of buildings development standard in Clause 4.3 and the Floor Space Ratio development standard in Clause 4.4 of Randwick Local Environmental Plan 2012.
- B. That the RLPP refuse consent under Sections 4.16 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979, as amended, to Development Application No. DA/451/2021 for alterations and additions to the existing building including a new upper floor level, and conversion of the use of the development from a Residential Flat Building to an attached dual occupancy including strata subdivision, at No. 70 Coogee Bay Road, Coogee, for the following reasons:
- The proposal exceeds the floor space and height standards of the Randwick Local Environmental Plan 2012, and fails to meet the requirements of clause 4.6 (4) in each respect. In particular, the proposed top (third) floor addition will have a significant impact on the existing streetscape of Coogee Bay Road, Coogee in terms of height, bulk, scale, character, its relationship with the roof form of the existing building as well as its relationship with the adjoining property, specifically:
 - The height of the proposed third floor addition exceeds maximum height standard for the site by 13.63%.
 - The design is not sympathetic to the existing façade and roof design of the existing or adjoining building.
 - The size of the proposed third floor addition is considered excessive and results in a non-compliance of floor space ratio standard of 7.8%.
 - The proposed third floor addition will appear prominent when viewed from Coogee Bay Road and uncharacteristic in terms of its architectural form and detail, including roof form and fenestration.

REASON:

The Panel has visited or is familiar with the site, considered the submissions and reviewed the assessment report prepared by Council officers that addresses the relevant matters detailed in Section 4.15 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979, as amended.

The Panel was of the view that any Third Floor addition should be setback behind the existing roof ridge (by the deletion of bedroom 3 and adjoining bathroom), so that the southern wall of the development more closely aligns with the top floor extension of 72 Coogee Bay Road. Any Third Floor addition needs to be further simplified in terms of its architectural form and detailing, including the roof form and fenestration. The reduction in size and height of the third floor would reduce the extent of exceedance of height and floor space standards.

The Panel refuses the application for the reasons given in the resolution above.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The meeting closed at 4:15pm.

CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES BY PANEL MEMBERS	
Annelise Tuor (Chairperson)	Deborah Laidlaw
Kara Krason	Peter Ryan